



STRATEGIC TRANSPORT PROJECTS REVIEW

PROTECTING OUR CLIMATE
AND IMPROVING LIVES



Appendix I: Recommendation Appraisal Summary Tables

December 2022

Jacobs **AECOM**

1. Detailed Appraisal Summary

An 'Appendix I: Recommendation Appraisal Summary Tables (ASTs) Explanatory Note' accompanies this AST.

1.1. Recommendation 6 – Behavioural Change Initiatives

Recommendation 6 – Behavioural change initiatives

[The Scottish Government's Individual, Social and Material \(ISM\) tool identifies that changing people's behaviours to better accord with public policy outcomes relies on amending individual, social and material factors that influence those behaviours.](#)

Most recommendations in STPR2 seek to influence material factors in relation to transport infrastructure and/or services. This recommendation would use a range of social marketing tools to influence social and individual factors in ways which support the achievement of STPR2's Transport Planning Objectives (TPOs). It would complement many other STPR2 interventions and build upon successful experience in Scotland, much of which is delivered by the on-going Transport Scotland-funded Smarter Choices, Smarter Places (SCSP) programme.

The recommendation would deliver (or provide support for delivery of) activities which provide encouragement, enablement and incentivisation for more people to make use of active and sustainable transport choices more often through national, regional and/or local initiatives.

It would help encourage people to move through relevant stages of change, raising awareness of transport choices, turning contemplation about adopting sustainable behaviours into action; helping those that have made positive choices to continue to do so; and, through effective promotion, highlighting the benefits to others at earlier stages of change.

Example initiatives and activities include:

- Campaigns and promotional activities to raise awareness using a range of digital, social and print media;
- Production and dissemination of information (such as maps, timetables, smartphone apps) to enable individuals to understand what routes or services are available;
- Financial incentives (such as discounted public transport taster tickets or discounted cycle hire membership);
- Community events and activities (such as cycle try-outs, led walks); and
- Competitions and challenges with rewards/prizes (such as for the primary school classes with the highest proportion of children walking to school).

1.2. Relevance

Relevant to communities across Scotland

This recommendation is relevant to all parts of Scotland, and everybody travelling within. Behavioural change interventions are likely to be particularly cost-effective:

- If they accompany the introduction of new/improved transport services or infrastructure;
- If they are focussed on people that are undergoing other life events which affect travel choices (e.g. starting a family, children starting or changing school, starting or changing job, retirement, change in health circumstances; and
- Where the alternative travel option being suggested is credible (e.g. active journeys that are short enough for people to realistically achieve; a public transport service that is high quality and reliable).

“[A guide to delivering effective Smarter Choices, Smarter Places projects](#)”, funded by Transport Scotland, is particularly relevant for implementation of this recommendation.

[Evidence from previous large-scale programmes in Scotland suggests that around 40% of those reached make positive changes in their travel choices.](#) Experience shows that the best value routes into communities of modest-scale travel behavioural change initiatives are likely to be through schools, workplaces and community groups/events (A Toolkit for delivering Personal Travel Planning in the Highlands and Islands, HITRANS, 2015).

1.3. Estimated Cost

<£25 million capital

Delivery of this recommendation would require revenue rather than capital funding.

The local authority programme of SCSP funding has invested £5 million each year since 2015 into travel behavioural change programmes. [Evaluation of the 2018/19 year's funding](#) suggested that at least 235,000 residents of Scotland were reached (i.e. influenced by its messages), so an average cost of just over £20 per person. Delivering appropriate messages to the total population of Scotland (approximately 5.5 million, as interventions are relevant to almost all adults and children) could therefore be expected to cost around £110 million.

It might be reasonable to seek to reach each individual once every three years (recognising the regular changes in travel patterns that most people are subject to), suggesting an annual revenue funding requirement in the region of £35 million. However, this could be readily scaled according to need and budget.

1.4. Position in Sustainable Investment Hierarchy

Reduces the need to travel unsustainably

This recommendation would contribute to 10 of the 12 NTS2 outcomes:

- Provide fair access to services we need;
- Be easy to use for all;
- Be affordable for all;
- Be reliable, efficient and high quality;
- Help deliver our net-zero target;
- Promote greener, cleaner choices;
- Be safe and secure for all;
- Get people and goods to where they need to get to;
- Enable us to make healthy travel choices; and
- Help make our communities great places to live.

1.5. Summary Rationale

Summary of Appraisal

	TPO					STAG					SIA				
	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
Low Scenario	++	++	++	+	+	+	+	++	+	++	+	++	+	++	++
High Scenario	++	++	++	+	+	+	+	++	+	++	+	++	+	++	++

This recommendation makes a positive contribution to all STPR2 Transport Planning Objectives (TPOs), STAG criteria, and Statutory Impact Assessment criteria.

Behavioural change initiatives that encourage greater use of active and sustainable travel choices are readily implementable and of comparatively low cost noting that interventions are scalable both in geographic coverage and in the level of output. Delivery would be undertaken at local, regional and national level by local authorities, Regional Transport Partnerships and Transport Scotland, as well as a range of other public and third sector delivery partners.

Behavioural change initiatives would complement many other recommendations being considered for implementation by STPR2, by raising awareness and encouraging individuals to use the most appropriate transport choice for their journey, whether active travel, public transport or shared mobility services, or to encourage use of systems such as Mobility as a Service (MaaS).

There is already much experience in Scotland and elsewhere of the successful delivery of initiatives to encourage transport behaviour change, building upon tried-and-tested approaches and a growing body of evidence of the effectiveness of such initiatives to increase uptake in the use of active and sustainable transport modes.

2. Context

2.1. Problems and Opportunities

This recommendation could help to tackle the following problem and opportunities:

Relevant Problem & Opportunity Themes Identified in National Case for Change

- **Changing Travel Behaviour:** changing people’s travel behaviour to use more sustainable modes would have a positive impact on the environment, as well as health and wellbeing.
- **Information and Integration:** high-quality journey planning information, both digital and physical, is important to enable a resilient transport system that allows people and goods to get to where they need to get to. Some journeys are not possible due to a lack of connections or accessible modes of transport, and long wait times, the need for multiple tickets and complex connections deter people from some public transport services resulting in many running below capacity.
- **Physical Activity:** the importance of active travel is becoming more evident as the consequences of physical inactivity are studied. [It is recognised that one of the most effective ways to secure the required 30 minutes of moderate activity per day is to reduce reliance on motorised transport](#), changing the means of everyday travel to walking and cycling.

2.2. Interdependencies

This recommendation has potential overlap with other STPR2 recommendations and would also complement other areas of Scottish Government activity.

Other STPR2 Recommendations

- Connected neighbourhoods (1);
- Active freeways and cycle parking hubs (2);
- Village-town active travel connections (3);
- Connecting towns by active travel (4);
- Long-distance active travel network (5);
- Changing road user behaviour (7);
- Increasing active travel to school (8).
- Improving access to bikes (9);
- Expansion of 20mph limits and zones (10);
- Clyde Metro (11);
- Edinburgh and South East Scotland Mass Transit (12);
- Aberdeen Rapid Transit (13);
- Investment in Demand Responsive Transport and Mobility as a Service (20);
- Framework for the delivery of mobility hubs (22);
- Smart, integrated public transport ticketing (23); and
- Improving active travel on trunk roads through communities (37).

Other areas of Scottish Government activity

- [Smarter Choices, Smarter Places](#)
- [Active Travel Framework \(2020\)](#);
- [The National Walking Strategy \(2014\)](#);
- [Cycling Action Plan for Scotland \(CAPS\)](#);
- [Town Centre Action Plan \(2013\)](#);
- [The Place Principle](#);
- [Climate Change Plan 2018-32 Update](#);
- [Low Carbon Travel and Transport Challenge Fund](#);
- [Clean Air for Scotland 2 – Towards a Better Place for Everyone](#)
- [Low Emission Zones \(LEZ\)](#);
- [Bus Partnership Fund \(BPF\)](#);
- [Places for Everyone](#);
- [Bikeability Scotland](#);
- [Scotland's Road Safety Framework to 2030](#); and
- [MaaS Investment Fund](#).

3. Appraisal

This section provides an assessment of the recommendation against:

- STPR2 Transport Planning Objectives (TPOs);
- STAG criteria;
- Deliverability criteria; and
- Statutory Impact Assessment criteria.

The seven-point assessment scale has been used to indicate the impact of the recommendation when considered under the ‘Low’ and ‘High’ Transport Behaviour Scenarios (which are described in Appendix F of the Technical Report).

3.1. Transport Planning Objectives

1. A sustainable strategic transport system that contributes significantly to the Scottish Government’s net-zero emissions target

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Behavioural change initiatives can have a significant positive impact on travel choices, including on reducing car use, hence carbon emissions. Depending on the target markets and messages, reductions in car trips of between 5% and 18% have been reported by previous initiatives .

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on this objective in both Low and High scenarios.

2. An inclusive strategic transport system that improves the affordability and accessibility of public transport

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Many behavioural change initiatives and activities focus on promoting inclusive transport choices; providing information and encouragement to use active modes and public transport and, depending on the initiative, can help reduce some of the cost-related barriers associated with sustainable travel. These can help people overcome social exclusion. [Examples of projects delivered in Scotland by the SCSP programme](#) include free bus tickets for asylum seekers to help access training and services, activities to help older people become confident cyclists, and discounted child bus fares to reduce the cost of family travel for low-income households.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on this objective in both Low and High scenarios.

3. A cohesive strategic transport system that enhances communities as places, supporting health and wellbeing

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

By encouraging more people to walk, wheel and cycle more often, behavioural change initiatives can significantly increase active travel, enhancing public health and wellbeing and community cohesion.

Depending on the target markets and messages, [increases in non-car trips \(most of which would either be by active modes, or include some activity as part of a public transport journey\) of between 7% and 34% have been reported. In previous large-scale programmes in Scotland that promoted walking and cycling, around 40% of those reached were more active as a result.](#)

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on this objective in both Low and High scenarios.

4. An integrated strategic transport system that contributes towards sustainable inclusive growth in Scotland

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

Behavioural change initiatives can be effective at encouraging and enabling more people to make local journeys by active and public transport modes more often. [This supports inclusive growth by enabling more people to be economically active and also support local businesses and services. Initiatives can also aid access to training and employment.](#)

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on this objective in both Low and High scenarios.

5. A reliable and resilient strategic transport system that is safe and secure for users.

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

[Initiatives have been shown to be successful in encouraging more people to be out and about within communities, so reducing fear of crime.](#)

The promotion of sustainable modes of transport can also reduce private vehicle use, which reduces the potential for accidents.

No impacts on reliability or resilience are anticipated.

Overall, this recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on this objective in both Low and High scenarios.

3.2. STAG Criteria

1. Environment

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

See Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) below.

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on this on criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

2. Climate Change

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

This recommendation would help generate a modal shift from car to sustainable modes for some journeys and would thus lead to a modest reduction in greenhouse gas emissions.

No impact on the Vulnerability to Effects of Climate Change or Potential to Adapt to Effects of Climate Change is anticipated.

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

3. Health, Safety and Wellbeing

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

By encouraging more people to walk, wheel and cycle more often, behavioural change initiatives can significantly increase active and sustainable travel, enhancing public health and wellbeing and community cohesion.

Depending on the target markets and messages, [increases in non-car trips \(most of which would either be by active modes, or include some activity as part of a public transport journey\) of between 7% and 34% have been reported. In previous large-scale programmes in Scotland that promoted walking and cycling, around 40% of those reached were more active as a result.](#)

[Behavioural change initiatives have been shown to be successful in encouraging more people to be out and about within communities](#), so reducing personal security concerns.

The promotion of sustainable modes of transport can also reduce private vehicle use, which has the potential to reduce accidents.

The initiatives within this recommendation could improve access to health and wellbeing infrastructure.

There would be no impacts on visual amenity.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

4. Economy

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

[Behavioural change initiatives can be effective at encouraging and enabling more people to make local journeys by active and public transport modes more often](#), so supporting local businesses and services. [They can also aid access to training and employment](#).

The recommendation would also provide local employment, training and volunteering opportunities for staff who are involved in delivering interventions.

No impact on transport economic efficiency is anticipated.

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

5. Equality and Accessibility

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Many behavioural change initiatives and activities focus on promoting inclusive transport choices; providing information and encouragement to use active modes and public transport, as well as also reducing some of the cost-related barriers associated with sustainable travel. These can help people overcome social exclusion. [Examples of projects delivered in Scotland by the SCSP programme](#) include free bus tickets for asylum seekers to help access training and services, activities to help older people become confident cyclists, and discounted child bus fares to reduce the cost of family travel for low-income households.

Initiatives delivered through this recommendation would reach specific socio-demographic groups, including young people, women, older people, disabled people, individuals with health problems and from more deprived communities.

No impact on active travel or public transport network coverage is anticipated, however initiatives would encourage greater use of existing and new facilities and services.

Also refer to EQIA/ICIA/FSDA/CRWIA Assessment in the next section.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

3.3. Deliverability

1. Feasibility

There is already significant experience of the effective delivery of behavioural change initiatives in Scotland and elsewhere, with Transport Scotland-funded published guidance available on how best to design and deliver programmes. This recommendation is readily feasible and would comprise a more significant roll-out of well-established interventions to more people across Scotland.

Delivery would be undertaken at local, regional and national level by local authorities and, Regional Transport Partnerships, as well as a range of other public and third sector delivery partners.

The role of Transport Scotland would be to support and facilitate implementation through funding.

2. Affordability

There are no capital costs associated with this recommendation, but it would require ongoing revenue funding to deliver. The recommendation would likely have greater impact on behaviours if a regular programme of measures were delivered over a rolling period (e.g. three years) as opposed to one-off major investment, recognising that peoples' travel habits change due to life circumstances, and that behaviours wane over time. The level of intervention could be scaled accordingly depending on the availability of funding.

3. Public Acceptability

[Over 25% of Scottish adults are 'looking to change' towards increased rates of active travel.](#)

Many behavioural change initiatives have been, or are being, delivered in Scotland. They tend to have broad public support from organisations and members of the public.

3.4. Statutory Impact Assessment Criteria

1. Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA)

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

This recommendation is likely to result in positive effects on SEA objectives related to reducing greenhouse gas emission (Objective 1) and improving air quality (Objective 3), as it seeks to encourage a modal shift to more sustainable and active travel methods, and, as a result, reducing transport-related air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions.

The recommendation would have a positive effect on the sustainable use of the transport network and natural resource usage (Objectives 8 and 9). It would also benefit four SEA Objectives that fall under the population and human health SEA topic. These objectives are related to quality of life and sustainable accessibility, noise and vibration, the public realm and safety (Objectives 4 to 7). The positive scores are derived from the aims of this recommendation to promote more sustainable use of the existing transport network, encourage sustainable access and increase travel choice through financial incentives and enablement of change for those otherwise unable to access travel options.

Negligible effects are predicted for the remaining SEA objectives as there is unlikely to be a significant influence on these receptors.

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive effect on addressing this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

2. Equalities Impact Assessment (EqIA)

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Many behavioural change initiatives and activities focus on promoting inclusive transport choices; providing information and encouragement to use active modes and public transport, as well as also reducing some of the cost-related barriers associated with sustainable travel. [Examples of projects delivered in Scotland by the SCSP programme](#) include free bus tickets for asylum seekers to help access training and services, activities to help older people become confident cyclists, and discounted child bus fares to reduce the cost of family travel for lower-income households.

An increase in active travel may improve health outcomes through physical fitness and mental wellbeing benefits and is also likely to lead to air quality improvements if the uptake is matched by a reduction in private vehicle use and traffic congestion. Improved health outcomes as a result of better air quality are of particular benefit to those who are more vulnerable to air pollution, including children, older people and disabled people.

The extent to which groups with protected characteristics can benefit from behavioural change initiatives would depend on which audiences are reached through initiatives, and through provision of ongoing support to enable groups to continue to use sustainable travel in the long-term.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on addressing this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

3. Island Communities Impact Assessment (ICIA)

Low Scenario	High Scenario
+	+

As with the EqIA assessment above, island communities could benefit from improved and less costly access to essential services and recreation. However, the extent to which island communities would benefit from behavioural change initiatives would depend on the nature of the initiatives, which audiences are reached through initiatives, and through provision of ongoing support to enable groups to continue to use sustainable travel in the long-term.

Behavioural change initiatives are relevant to all parts of Scotland, including the islands (e.g. HITRANS' HItravel programme delivered effective change when delivered in Stornoway; over half of all participants reported that they had reduced their car use, 30% were cycling more and 48% walking more, indicating that the population of Stornoway are willing and able to make changes to their travel choices).

This recommendation is expected to have a minor positive impact on addressing this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

4. Children's Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment (CRWIA)

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Many behavioural change initiatives focus on children and/or families, providing support and encouragement for healthy, independent travel by children (including better and less costly access to education and other services), or enabling low-income families to gain access to a wider range of transport choices to aid inclusion (e.g. parent and carer access to employment) The promotion of sustainable modes of transport can also reduce private vehicle use, leading to a reduction in adverse impacts, such as traffic emissions and fear of road danger, which can significantly affect children and young people.

However, the extent to which children and young people can benefit from behavioural change initiatives would depend on which audiences are reached, and through provision of ongoing support to enable them to continue to use sustainable

travel in the long-term.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on addressing this criterion in both Low and High scenarios.

5. Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment (FSDA)

Low Scenario	High Scenario
++	++

Behavioural change initiatives and activities focus on promoting inclusive transport choices; providing information and encouragement to use active modes and public transport, as well as reducing the short-term cost-related barriers to sustainable travel through financial incentives or discounts. The potential reach of this recommendation is wide-ranging, including urban, rural and island communities. As well as benefitting these ‘communities of place’, the recommendation is likely to additionally improve access to services for ‘communities of interest’, including those with lower access to private vehicle use (such as women, young people and low-income households) and others who may benefit from less costly travel options.

Greater knowledge of the transport network and offer of financial incentives/discounts can encourage people to find cheaper alternatives to private car travel resulting in more affordable access to essential services such as employment, education, healthcare and leisure facilities.

However, the extent to which socio-economically disadvantaged groups can benefit from behavioural change initiatives would depend on which audiences are reached, and through provision of ongoing support to enable groups to continue to use sustainable travel in the long-term.

This recommendation is expected to have a moderate positive impact on criterion in both Low and High scenarios.