



**TRANSPORT
SCOTLAND**
CÒMHDHAIL ALBA

SCOTTISH SAFETY CAMERA PROGRAMME REVIEW

SUMMARY REPORT – CONCLUSIONS AND NEXT STEPS



INTRODUCTION

1. The Scottish Government has supported the delivery of the Scottish Safety Camera Programme since 2002, with the Programme expanding to cover all of mainland Scotland. Road traffic deaths in Scotland are at their lowest levels since records began,¹ and safety cameras continue to be an integral element of our *Road Safety Framework to 2020*,² play a crucial role in speed enforcement, and are an effective means of reducing accidents.
2. The Programme has been delivered on the ground through eight Safety Camera Partnerships (SCPs), aligning with the eight legacy Police Force boundaries. However many existing partnership practices have been in operation for around ten years with inconsistencies in practice, workload and processes evident across the SCPs. In order, therefore, to ensure that SCPs deliver the most effective and efficient outcomes, that best use is made of current resources to help deliver accident reductions on Scotland's roads, and with the creation of a single police service for Scotland in April 2013 (and their implementation of numerous service delivery changes to improve efficiency), a comprehensive Review of the Safety Camera Programme was undertaken.
3. While maintaining funding at existing levels, the Review was concerned with the delivery and outcomes of the Programme, and focussed on two main areas: the existing outcomes and functionality of SCPs; and the structure of SCPs. The principle of safety camera enforcement on Scotland's roads is embedded in our Road Safety Framework, and was not part of this Review.

REVIEW AND CONSULTATION - METHOD

4. In line with their responsibility for developing Scottish Government safety camera policy, and managing the Safety Camera Programme budget, on behalf of Scottish Ministers, Transport Scotland led the Review. An Executive Board (chaired by Transport Scotland, and including representatives from the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (CoSLA), the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives (SOLACE), the Society of Chief Officers of Transportation Scotland (SCOTS), Police Scotland and the Scottish Police Authority (SPA)) was established to consider and direct based on recommendations from the Management Board. In turn, the Management Board (again chaired by Transport Scotland, and including representatives from Police Scotland, the Chairs of Partnerships Boards, Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service (COPFS), SCOTS, the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (SFRS), and NHS Scotland) tasked a Project Team in taking forward work on the Review. This Project Team included representatives from the Safety Camera Programme Office, SCP Managers and Police Scotland.

¹ Source – Reported Road Casualties Scotland 2013, available at: <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/statistics/reported-road-casualties-scotland-all-editions>

² Scotland's Road Safety Framework to 2020 is available at: <http://www.gov.scot/Resource/Doc/274552/0082161.pdf>

5. As part of the wider Review, Transport Scotland launched the Scottish Safety Camera Programme consultation in February 2014. The consultation sought views on the purpose, structure, and governance of SCPs.³
6. The consultation received 39 responses in total from a range of organisations and individuals. This included 17 responses from Local Authorities (LAs), nine from stakeholder organisations, and six from SCPs and related bodies. The remaining responses were either received from individuals; it was requested that details remain confidential; or the Respondent Information Form required with the response was not submitted or incomplete. Transport Scotland are grateful to all who took the time to respond to the consultation paper.⁴
7. Additional to the public consultation, a series of stakeholder events took place across the country. A programme of twelve workshops covering the five themes of the Review (purpose and remit, structure, governance, site selection and data, and finance) was completed with attendance from across the stakeholder landscape.⁵
8. Furthermore, due to the complex and technical nature of the site selection and data theme, and the differing perspectives on this, a focus group of relevant stakeholders was also undertaken. This looked to progress issues raised at the workshops, assess the benefits of the views proposed, seek agreement on site selection principles, and drill down into the detail required in developing future criteria for camera deployment.⁶
9. Complementing the external information gathering, and in order to ensure that SCPs deliver the most effective and efficient outcomes, data pertaining to each partnership was analysed. This included detailed consideration of staffing and salaries, budgets, workload and the road safety challenge in each partnership area.

REVIEW AND CONSULTATION - ANALYSIS

10. Following the completion of the consultation, an analysis of the responses, along with the stakeholder events and information gathered was undertaken.⁷
11. Additionally, analysis of SCP and staffing data informed a narrative on the existing outcomes and functionality of the SCPs suggesting evidence that:
 - national and local outcomes could be improved upon and delivered in a more effective and efficient manner;

³ The consultation document is available at: <http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2014/02/2766>

⁴ Responses to the consultation are available at: <http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2014/06/6284>

⁵ Reports from the stakeholder workshops are available at: <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/road/scottish-safety-camera-programme>

⁶ The focus group report is available at: <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/road/scottish-safety-camera-programme>

⁷ The summary analysis of responses received to the consultation available at: <http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2014/07/1538>. Combined analysis of the responses and stakeholder events is available at: <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/road/scottish-safety-camera-programme>

- national agreement on, and adoption of, certain best practices could result in an improved and more consistent Programme; and
 - economies of scale and the opportunities these provide could be taken advantage of for greater targeted investment in front-line services and better outcomes.
12. In respect of the staffing position across the SCPs, the data revealed that the eight SCP structure inhibits the application of economies of scale. Inconsistencies and inequalities were identified in respect of the distribution of staff and workload, responsibilities and job descriptions, and salaries across the SCPs (with an opportunity identified for reinvestment in front-line enforcement activity).
13. The need for consistent high quality analytical provision and implementation across Scotland was also identified, along with opportunities for consistency in the back office provision and the rationalisation of structures along COPFS federated area boundaries.
14. Opportunities were also identified with regards to: consistency in the police officer presence to satisfy the legal process; staff attendance at court; and addressing the inflexibilities created by partnership boundaries.

FINAL PROPOSAL

15. The Executive Board, at a meeting in June 2014, agreed a range of proposals across the Review's five themes.⁸ The key points agreed include:
- potential in alternative structures;
 - need to retain local engagement;
 - potential role for the Road Safety Strategic Partnership Board;
 - revision of selection criteria required; and the need to
 - standardise financial processes.
16. Following agreement on these proposals, Police Scotland, through the Management Board, were then asked to consider how they would propose to deliver the most effective and efficient structure through their operations. Should there be no formal partnership boards they were also asked to determine how local accountability and strategic governance would function around this. This proposal was considered at a further meeting of the Executive Board in August 2014, with the key aspects as follows:
- Safety Camera Programme to be delivered through a three region model;
 - Regional teams to comprise of a safety camera manager, communications officer and data analyst. Back office and enforcement staff numbers maintained in existing locations (increased where site selection process indicates greatest casualty reduction potential);
 - Operational delivery to continue from all currently deployed Police Scotland staff in their current offices for the medium term;

⁸ The proposals are listed as an annex to the Highlight Report available at : <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/road/scottish-safety-camera-programme>

- Greater deployment flexibility, and improved operational effectiveness through reinvestment of structural savings into frontline enforcement activity;
- Improved local accountability and scrutiny through existing, well-established forums, Community Planning Partnerships, and Local Policing Plans, reflecting local circumstance, and removing the requirement for partnership boards;
- Local stakeholders, including Road Authorities and Police Scotland, to provide input to site selection and assessment;
- Strategic governance realised through the Road Safety Strategic Partnership Board;
- Police Scotland responsible for operational prioritisation and deployment of camera enforcement resources, in line with the revised Handbook;
- Streamlined funding and greater flexibility realised through direct grant funding allocation to Police Scotland through Scottish Police Authority; and,
- No compulsory redundancies

AGREEMENT AND NEXT STEPS

17. Executive Board Members agreed that they were content, in principle, with the Management Board's Proposal, and that they would support it for endorsement with their respective organisations. Subsequent formal endorsement was achieved from Members, indicating that the Review's recommendation was complete.
18. The Review's recommendation marks a significant step in delivering lasting improvements to the Safety Camera Programme and maximising its collision and casualty reduction potential. The new Programme Handbook,⁹ reflecting the recommendation, sets out the rules and guidance to which the Programme must operate, and includes a range of measures that will:
- improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the Programme;
 - strengthen national strategic oversight;
 - improve local accountability; and
 - ensure national consistency and greater flexibility of deployment.
19. In delivering the recommendation, Police Scotland are progressing through relevant HR processes. Transport Scotland will continue to develop and advise on safety camera policy, and maintain ownership of the Handbook. The Safety Camera Programme Office will manage the Programme and its performance, evaluating and benchmarking enforcement activity on a national basis. Engagement with stakeholders will be monitored to ensure continuity of service delivery.

⁹ The Safety Camera Programme Handbook is available at: <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/road/scottish-safety-camera-programme>

20. The Area Safety Camera Managers will now develop their operational plans, working together with the Road Authorities to assess the road network and prioritise sites for safety camera activity.